Differentiation of the continental crust by relamination

Bradley R. Hacker a,⁎, Peter B. Kelemen b, Mark D. Behn c

a Earth Science, University of California, Santa Barbara, California, USA
b Lamont Doherty Earth Observatory, Columbia University, Palisades, NY, USA
c Geology and Geophysics, Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution, Woods Hole, MA, USA

A R T I C L E   I N F O
Article history:
Received 14 February 2011
Received in revised form 12 May 2011
Accepted 13 May 2011
Available online 2 June 2011

Editor: T.M. Harrison

Keywords:
continental crust
relamination
differentiation
subduction erosion
subduction
continental refinery

A B S T R A C T
Crust extracted from the mantle in arcs is refined into continental crust in subduction zones. During sediment subduction, subduction erosion, arc subduction, and continent subduction, mafic rocks become eclogite and may sink into the mantle, whereas more silica-rich rocks are transformed into felsic gneisses that are less dense than peridotite but more dense than the upper crust. These more felsic rocks rise buoyantly, undergo decompression melting and melt extraction, and are relaminated to the base of the crust. As a result of this process, such felsic rocks could form much of the lower crust. The lower crust need not be mafic and the bulk continental crust may be more silica rich than generally considered.

© 2011 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction: differentiation of the continental crust

The origin and composition of continental crust—particularly the lower crust—remain enigmatic. The principal conundrum to be resolved is how an andesitic to dacitic continental crust has formed when most mantle-derived magmas are basaltic. This differentiation has been explained as the result of lower crustal foundering (Arndt and Goldstein, 1989; Kay and Kay, 1991), crustal formation from primary mantle-derived andesitic magmas (Kelemen, 1995), or the mixing of basaltic rock with silicic magma derived by partial melting of mafic, subducting crust (Martin, 1986).

In their seminal papers, Herzberg et al. (1983) and Ringwood and Green (1966) introduced the idea that igneous processes can lead to crustal differentiation by lower crustal foundering if mantle-derived basaltic magma intruded into the crust forms a buoyant differentiate that is retained in the crust, plus a dense, olivine- and pyroxene-rich residue that sinks into the mantle (Fig. 1A). Kay and Kay (1991) expanded this idea by postulating that differentiation and lower crustal foundering might also be driven by the formation of metamorphic garnet in mafic rock (Fig. 1B). Jul and Kelemen (2001) quantified aspects of lower crustal foundering, and noted that buoyancy and viscosity requirements restrict significant lower crustal foundering to relatively warm environments such as rifts or active volcanoplutonic arcs. Though foundering of dense garnet granulites and pyroxenites probably is recorded in some arc sections (DeBari and Sleep, 1991; Kelemen et al., 2003a), loss of these rocks still yielded a mafic arc crust very different from continental crust (DeBari and Sleep, 1991; Greene et al., 2006). This is so because garnet-free mafic rocks that are either density-stable or too viscous to founder remain in the cold, upper and middle crust.

Whereas foundering of dense material could potentially produce a differentiated continental crust, two other tectonic processes—subduction erosion (Fig. 1C) and sediment subduction (Fig. 1D) (von Huene and Scholl, 1991)—are usually presumed to work in the opposite sense, by returning differentiated crust to the mantle. The most recent calculations (Scholl and von Huene, 2007) suggest that this process recycles continental crust back into the mantle at the same rate that continental crust is created. This could produce a steady-state crustal volume (Armstrong, 1981) and a constant composition.

This paper investigates another paradigm for differentiation of the continental crust: The mantle produces differentiated crust in intra-oceanic arcs. This raw crustal material is subsequently subducted, devolatilized, and melted, and separated into a mafic residue that returns to the mantle and a felsic fraction that is relaminated to the base of the crust in the upper plate. This process will be most efficient in arcs where upper mantle temperatures are sufficiently high at the base of the crust (Kelemen et al., 2003b) to permit vertical viscous flow due to lithologic buoyancy of the felsic fraction (Jull and Kelemen, 2001). This ‘continental refinery’ makes continental crust. We envision that this refining of raw crustal material into continental crust can take place via relamination during four subduction-zone processes (Fig. 2): i) sediment subduction, ii) arc subduction, iii) subduction erosion, and iv) continent subduction.
The re-lamination process can take the form of a) imbrication of material beneath the crust in the upper plate (Kimbrough and Grove, 2007), b) buoyant ascent from mantle depths to the base of the crust along a “subduction channel” (Gerya et al., 2007; Li and Gerya, 2009; Warren et al., 2008), and/or c) ascent of buoyant diapirs through the mantle wedge to the base of the crust (Behn et al., in review; Currie et al., 2007; Gerya and Melilick, 2011; Gerya and Yuen, 2003; Gorczyk et al., 2006; Kelemen et al., 2003a; Yin et al., 2007; Zhu et al., 2009). As discussed below, these processes may be more efficient than lower crustal foundering at generating large volumes of material with the major- and trace-element composition of continental crust, by re-laminating the base of the crust with buoyant felsic rocks, and by purging the crust of eclogitized mafic rocks and dense residues produced by melting.

2. The composition and physical properties of continental crust

Earth’s continental crust is distinct from the underlying mantle in that it is andesitic to dacitic (rather than ultramafic), has slower seismic velocities ($V_p \approx 6.7$ km/s, rather than $>7.5$ km/s) and is less dense ($\sim 2600–3000$ kg/m$^3$, rather than $>3300$ kg/m$^3$) (Christensen and Mooney, 1995). It is typically subdivided into two or three discrete layers (Fig. 3A) on the basis of seismic velocities (Holbrook et al., 1992; Smithson, 1978), and considerable work has gone into inferring the compositions of these layers. Dividing the crust into three compositionally distinct layers on the basis of seismic velocity may be unwarranted because of the poor correlation between velocity and composition (Behn and Kelemen, 2003); the velocity of the lower crust could be higher than the mid crust due to mineralogical differences, such as the presence of garnet in the lower crust, rather than to a systematic compositional difference. Thus, here we make the simplifying assumption that there are just two layers: an upper crust and a lower crust (Fig. 3B).

The composition and physical properties of the upper continental crust are reasonably well known from exposures and from the composition of fine-grained clastic sediment such as shale and loess (e.g., the upper crust averages $\sim 67$ wt.% $\text{SiO}_2$; Rudnick and Gao, 2003). The composition of the lower crust, however, is more enigmatic. The principal difficulty is that, while there are many metamorphic terrains that record peak pressures of 8 to 12 kb, corresponding to lower crustal depths in cratons and mid-crustal levels of orogenic plateaus, there is no consensus that these are representative of typical or “average” lower crust. This problem applies to inferred “mid-crustal” exposures as well. Similarly, xenoliths erupted from lower crustal depths may be atypical because the basaltic lavas that host most xenoliths may not erupt through felsic lower crust (Jaupart and Mareschal, 2003) or may assimilate felsic xenoliths.

Physical properties (i.e., velocity, gravity, and heat flow) provide indirect constraints on the composition of the lower crust (Rudnick and Gao, 2003). For instance, the measured P-wave velocity of the lower crust is typically 6.7–7.1 km/s (Christensen and Mooney, 1995; Rudnick and Fountain, 1995), most likely corresponding to densities of 2900–3200 kg/m$^3$ (Christensen and Mooney, 1995). This has been

![Fig. 1. Long-term change in the composition of the continental crust has conventionally been viewed as the result of two major “subduction factory” processes. A) Mantle-derived magma introduced into volcanoplutonic arcs differentiates into an andesitic fraction that is retained in the crust and an ultramafic cumulate that becomes part of the mantle (Arndt and Goldstein, 1989). B) Mafic rock at the base of a thick volcanoplutonic arc is converted into garnet granulite and sinks into the mantle (Herzberg et al., 1983). Two other major subduction-related processes are envisioned to work in the opposite sense, by removing differentiated material from the crust and returning it to the mantle. C) Crustal material ablated from the upper plate of a subduction system is returned to the mantle by subduction erosion (Scholl and von Huene, 2007; von Huene and Scholl, 1991). D) Trench sediments are returned to the mantle by subduction (Hilde, 1983). TBL: thermal boundary layer in mantle.](image-url)
Figure 2. Four tectonic settings for continental refining via relamination. In all cases, the relaminating layer may be thrust directly beneath existing crust, rise en bloc, perhaps in a “subduction channel”, or rise as diapirs through the mantle wedge, depending on physical conditions. In all cases, there may be melting that produces a liquid that ascends well above the relaminating layer and residues that are either positively or negatively buoyant with respect to the adjacent mantle. 1) Subducted sediment is thrust into or beneath arc lower crust, or is gravitationally unstable and rises to relaminate the base of the crust in the upper plate. 2) Subducted volcanoplutonic arcs undergo density separation as the mafic lower crust transforms to eclogite while the buoyant upper crust relaminates the base of the crust in the upper plate. 3) Felsic crustal material removed from the upper plate by subduction erosion is relaminated to the base of the crust in the upper plate; mafic material transforms to eclogite and sinks within the upper mantle. 4) Subducted felsic continental crust is relaminated to the base of the crust in the upper plate. Any (ultra)mafic material of sufficient size transforms to eclogite and returns to upper mantle.

used to infer that the lower crust is mafic (Rudnick and Fountain, 1995), but this range of velocities can be satisfied by a wide variety of rocks that range from 50 to 65 wt.% SiO2 and have similarly broad ranges of other major elements (Behn and Kelemen, 2003; Holbrook et al., 1992; Pakiser and Robinson, 1966; Reid et al., 1989; Rudnick and Fountain, 1995).

Heat-producing element abundances in the upper crust (producing 1.6 μW/m2) and inferred mantle heat flow have been subtracted from measured surface heat flow (51 mW/m2 in Paleozoic terrains, Jaupart and Mareschal, 2003) to infer that the lower crust is relatively unradiogenic (Rudnick and Fountain, 1995). For example, in Rudnick and Gao’s (2003) model for a three-layer crust and a mantle heat flow of 17 mW/m2, a 17-km thick lower crust can have a heat production rate of no more than 0.2 μW/m2, implying that it contains less than 0.6 wt.% K2O, 1.2 ppm Th and 0.2 ppm U (Fig. 3A) (Rudnick and Gao, 2003). Such a low inferred heat production rate, together with the compositions of post-Archean crustal xenoliths assumed to be representative of the lower crust, leads to the conclusion that the lower crust is dominantly (80%) mafic rock with, e.g., 53.4 wt.% SiO2 (Rudnick and Gao, 2003). If true, the principal tectonic process responsible for producing the lower crust might be underplating of mantle-generated, mafic melts or the accumulation of refractory products of fractional crystallization or anatexis.

However, neither mantle heat flow nor the distribution of radiogenic elements in the crust are well known. If either mantle heat flow or the concentration of radiogenic elements in the “mid-crust” has been overestimated, the radiogenic element concentration in the lower crust could be substantially higher, and thus the lower crust could contain a higher proportion of felsic rocks. As an extreme example, using the lower bound on mantle heat flow through Precambrian terrains of 11 mW/m2 (Jaupart and Mareschal, 2003) and assuming that there is no compositional distinction between the “mid-crust” and the lower crust, a surface heat flow of 51 mW/m2 allows a 26-km thick middle + lower crust composed of typical ‘post-Archean’ lower crustal granulites (Rudnick and Presper, 1990 database updated to 2003), with a median of 64 wt.% SiO2 and a median heat-production rate of 0.7 μW/m2 (Fig. 3B). In this case, no mafic lower crust is required by the seismic data or by the heat-flow data, and much of the lower crust could be felsic (Table 1).

Other data support the possibility that a significant proportion of the lower crust is composed of felsic, metasedimentary rocks. A minimum estimate for the proportion of metasediments in the lower continental crust can be derived using (Nesbitt and Young’s (1984) algorithm for identifying peraluminous compositions (an excess of Al2O3 relative to alkali elements, which stabilizes minerals more aluminous than plagioclase—a characteristic of metasediments). This methodology reveals that more than 27% of samples from granulate terrains, more than 14% of granulate xenoliths, and more than 43% of rocks from ultrahigh-pressure terrains (see below)—but only ~6% of Archean granulites—are peraluminous, pelitic metasediments (Fig. 4). These are minimum estimates of the proportion of felsic metasediments in the lower crust because metamorphosed
immature quartzofeldspathic sediment (“wacke”) is not peraluminous, and has an Al2O3/alkali ratio indistinguishable from metaluminous igneous rocks.

Thus, geophysical constraints permit the lower crust to be quite felsic and radiogenic—including significant amounts of peraluminous sediments—and the tectonic processes responsible for producing the lower crust may be different than commonly assumed.

3. Effects of prograde metamorphism and melting on rock physical properties

Before describing the relamination model, we review how the physical properties of crustal rocks—including density and seismic velocity—change in response to prograde metamorphism, partial melting, and melt extraction. Consider four compositions that span the range of crustal rock types: pelite (metamorphosed mudrock), wacke (immature quartzofeldspathic sediment), tonalite, and a mid-ocean ridge basalt (MORB) (Table 1). Because of the paucity of melt activity models for the conditions of interest, the effects of partial melting are best seen in experimental studies (Table 3) that i) used compositions similar to typical pelite, wacke, tonalite, and MORB, and that ii) reported phase proportions and compositions (Auzanneau et al., 2006; Montel and Vielzeuf, 1997; Patiño Douce, 2005; Patiño Douce and Harris, 1998; Rapp and Watson, 1991; Rapp and Watson, 1995; Schmidt et al., 2004; Sen and Dunn, 1994; Singh and Johannes, 1996; Vielzeuf and Holloway, 1988; Vielzeuf and Montel, 1994; Wolf and Wyllie, 1993). Fig. 5 shows the results of these studies: the amount of melt (Fig. 5A), the SiO2 content of the melt (Fig. 5B), the K2O content of the melt (Fig. 5C). It also shows the P-wave velocity (Fig. 5D) and density (Fig. 5E) calculated with the method of Hacker and Abers (2004), using the composition of the residue calculated from the modes and compositions of the solid phases in the experiments.

To quantify the effects of subsolidus prograde metamorphism, we calculated phase proportions and compositions for the same experimental bulk compositions using Perple_X v. 7 (Connolly, 1990) and the 2004 Holland and Powell (Holland and Powell, 1998) database; for similar, recent approaches using other bulk compositions, see Massonne et al. (2007) and Semprich et al. (2010). We used the following solution models: amphibole (Wei and Powell, 2003; White et al., 2003), biotite (Powell and Holland, 1999), chlorite (Holland et al., 1998), clinoxyroxene (Holland and Powell, 1996), K-feldspar (Thompson and Hovis, 1979), K-white mica (parameters from Thermocalc), garnet (Holland and Powell, 1996), and plagioclase (Fuhrman and Lindsay, 1988). We then calculated rock physical properties via the method of Hacker and Abers (2004). We used the same bulk H2O contents as the experimental melting studies and removed from the bulk composition any H2O produced by dehydration along prograde P–T paths. This minimizes the effects of dehydration and melting on changes in the rock physical properties. H2O-present melting is thus not considered.

We focus on two endmember PT paths (Fig. 6A) for the continental refraction model. These paths involve compression to 3 GPa and heating to 800 °C or 1050 °C, followed by decompression and cooling to 700 °C and 1 GPa. The first path is meant to simulate slab-top conditions in a
warm subduction zone (Syracuse et al., 2010) and the second simulates more extreme P–T conditions recorded by some UHP terrains and xenoliths (see below). The end of the paths at 700 °C and 1 GPa simulate relamination to the continental Moho in a convergent orogen; we consider i) complete mineralogical re-equilibration at 700 °C and 1 GPa (but no change in H2O content), and ii) metastable preservation of the high-pressure mineralogy, except for coesite, which we assume converts back to quartz.

For the modeled PT paths, the pelite undergoes large subsolidus increases in density and velocity (solid line in Fig. 6B) largely due to the growth of garnet; there is a particularly large— but reversible— increase associated with the quartz–coesite transformation. For the cold path, the pelite reaches a maximum density of ~3200 kg/m³ (unfilled diamond in Fig. 6B). Subsequent re-equilibration at Moho conditions returns the rock to nearly its original physical properties (open square in Fig. 6B); if the pelite reaches the Moho, but retains its

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SiO2</th>
<th>TiO2</th>
<th>Al2O3</th>
<th>FeO + MnO</th>
<th>MgO</th>
<th>CaO</th>
<th>Na2O</th>
<th>K2O</th>
<th>H2O</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pelite</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Shaw, 1956]</td>
<td>61.5</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Ferry, 1982]</td>
<td>60.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used in Perple_X (after Vielzeuf and Holloway, 1988, and other studies)</td>
<td>64.4</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>18.1</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wacke</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Pettijohn, 1963]</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Whetten et al., 1969]</td>
<td>66.5</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Ernst et al., 1980]</td>
<td>66.1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used in Perple_X (after Montel and Vielzeuf, 1997, and other studies)</td>
<td>70.4</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tonalite</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Nockolds, 1954]</td>
<td>66.2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Rollinson and Windley, 1980]</td>
<td>62.3</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Sheraton and Collerson, 1983]</td>
<td>69.8</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>0.8n.d.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Schmidt, 1993]</td>
<td>59.0</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><a href="http://www.earthchemportal.org/used">http://www.earthchemportal.org/used</a> in Perple_X (after Patiño Douce, 2005)</td>
<td>63.9</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MORB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Pearce, 1976], used in Perple_X</td>
<td>50.6</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>15.7</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talkeetna Arc harzburgite</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.B. Kelemen unpublished XRF data normalized to 100%</td>
<td>44.6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3
Reported melt compositions, normalized to 100% anhydrous, and calculated residue compositions.

| T °C | P GPa | Smelt | SIO₂ | TiO₂ | Al₂O₃ | FeO | MnO | MgO | CaO | Na₂O | K₂O | H₂O | SIO₂ | TiO₂ | Al₂O₃ | FeO | MnO | MgO | CaO | Na₂O | K₂O | H₂O |
|------|-------|-------|------|------|-------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| 805  | 4     | 76.8  | 0.3  | 13.4 | 0.8   | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| 850  | 4     | 71.2  | 0.6  | 16.1 | 1.9   | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 | 0.1 |
| 900  | 5     | 64.6  | 1.0  | 21.4 | 1.7   | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| 950  | 6     | 60.0  | 1.3  | 26.4 | 1.7   | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| 1000 | 7     | 56.0  | 1.7  | 31.4 | 1.7   | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| 1050 | 8     | 52.0  | 2.1  | 36.4 | 1.7   | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| 1100 | 9     | 48.0  | 2.5  | 41.4 | 1.7   | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |

For a better understanding, please refer to the original text for detailed explanations and context.
higher pressure mineralogy, its density and velocity undergo smaller reductions to ~3050 kg/m³ and 6.5 km/s (filled square in Fig. 6B). On the hot path, melting due to phengite breakdown begins at 800–900 °C and produces 19% melt by 900 °C and 49% melt by 1000 °C (Fig. 5A; Table 3). Numerous experimental, theoretical, and field studies suggest that melt in volumes up to 10% can separate from its source under typical lower crustal conditions and migrate to shallower crustal levels (e.g., Brown, 2007). If the pelite melt does separate from the rock, the residue produced at 900 °C reaches densities ~3300 kg/m³, and at 1000 °C reaches densities ~3500 kg/m³ (Fig. 5E, unfilled diamonds in Fig. 6C). If the 900 °C residue subsequently becomes reampliated at the Moho, it attains a velocity and density typical of the lower crust, regardless of whether it re-equilibrates (unfilled square in Fig. 6C) or retains a metastable high-pressure phase (filled square in Fig. 6C). A residue produced at 1000 °C will be negatively buoyant with respect to the mantle.

Along the same PT paths the wacke also undergoes subsolidus increases in density and velocity due to similar reactions and melt extraction. For the cold path, the wacke reaches a maximum density of >3100 kg/m³; upon return to the Moho, the wacke returns to its original physical properties if equilibrium obtains (unfilled square in Fig. 6B), but stays at ~2900 kg/m³ if high-pressure phases are retained (filled square). On the hot path, melting due to phengite breakdown begins between 800 and 900 °C and the melt fractions are 18% and 31% at 900 and 1000 °C, respectively (Table 3); if the melt begins between 800 and 900 °C and the melt fractions are 18 and 5% at 900 °C and 1000 °C, respectively (Table 3); if the melt separates, the residue reaches densities of ~3500 kg/m³ at peak conditions. Decomposition to 700 °C and 1 GPa under equilibrium conditions yields a density of ~3000 kg/m³, typical of the lower crust (Fig. 6B), whereas metastable retention of high-pressure minerals leads to minimal reductions in physical properties. At temperatures of 1050 °C and higher, the residue is negatively buoyant with respect to the mantle.

By the time MORB with a normal K$_2$O content (0.2 wt.%) reaches 800 °C and 3 GPa, it has undergone significant dehydration due to the breakdown of amphibole, and is nearly anhydrous: the concomitant growth of garnet and omphacite leads to eclogite with a density ~3400 kg/m³. In such a dehydrated state, mafic rock will produce much less than the 10 vol% melt seen in experiments on H$_2$O-rich amphibolite (Fig. 5); extraction of such small amounts of melt would not cause significant changes in the physical properties of the residue compared to the protolith. Because this lithology is denser than the surrounding mantle, it is unlikely to ascend buoyantly unless surrounded by other less dense material. However, if it did, cooling to 1 GPa and 700 °C leads to a rock with a density ~3200 kg/m³. Along the hot PT path, melting begins at ~900 °C and the volume of melt reaches 20–30% by 1050 °C in a MORB with 0.9 wt.% K$_2$O (Schmidt et al., 2004); if the melt separates, the residue reaches densities of ~3500 kg/m³ (Fig. 6B). Unaltered MORB, with ~4× less K$_2$O will produce ~4× less melt, which will likely not separate from the residue. In the unlikely event that dry MORB eclogite returned to the base of the crust, it would have a 1 GPa, 700 °C density of ~3200 kg/m³.

Thus, pelite, wacke and tonalite that undergo prograde metamorphism to 800 °C and 3 GPa (unfilled diamonds in Fig. 6D) have densities comparable to or greater than the lower crust, but remain buoyant with respect to the mantle. In this case, they may rise to the Moho (700 °C and 1 GPa); if the high-pressure minerals remain metastable, these rocks have densities similar to the lower crust, whereas if the rocks convert to minerals stable at 1 GPa, they will have densities little different than at STP and could rise higher in the crust. At the same peak conditions, MORB undergoes significant dehydration and reaches densities greater than that of mantle peridotite regardless of whether it melts. Such eclogites may therefore sink into the mantle. If eclogite-facies MORB rises to the Moho, for example as small bodies entrained in buoyant felsic rocks as observed in UHP terrains, it will be markedly denser than at STP because of this dehydration, but will be gravitationally stable compared to the underlying mantle.

### Table 3 (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>T °C</th>
<th>P GPa</th>
<th>%smelt</th>
<th>SiO$_2$</th>
<th>TiO$_2$</th>
<th>Al$_2$O$_3$</th>
<th>FEO</th>
<th>MnO</th>
<th>MgO</th>
<th>CaO</th>
<th>Na$_2$O</th>
<th>K$_2$O</th>
<th>H$_2$O</th>
<th>SiO$_2$</th>
<th>TiO$_2$</th>
<th>Al$_2$O$_3$</th>
<th>FEO</th>
<th>MnO</th>
<th>MgO</th>
<th>CaO</th>
<th>Na$_2$O</th>
<th>K$_2$O</th>
<th>H$_2$O</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>850</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>73.0</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>48.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>900</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>73.1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>950</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>73.4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>14.8</td>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1000</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>73.6</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1050</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>73.8</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1100</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>73.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SM, starting material.
In contrast, pelite, wacke and tonalite that reach 900–975 °C (depending on rock type) and undergo melt extraction (unfilled diamonds in Fig. 6B), have densities comparable to or less than the mantle. If they rise to the Moho (squares in Fig. 6B), these residues will have densities comparable to the lower crust.

MORB is gravitationally unstable with respect to mantle peridotite at 800–1050 °C, just as at 800 °C.

Thus, the calculations and experiments indicate that MORB is negatively buoyant with respect to the mantle at all temperatures at 3 GPa. All other crustal rocks that reach 900–975 °C produce large volumes of felsic melt that is buoyant and may ascend, and a refractory, high-wavespeed residue that is gravitationally stable within the mantle or at the base of the lower crust.

Experiments also show that dehydration melting of pelite, wacke and tonalite at temperatures up to 1050 °C (at 3–4 GPa) leads to Fe+
Mg enrichment and Na, K, and H$_2$O depletion of the residue (Fig. 5). Studies of rocks partially melted in orogenic belts at relatively low pressures (0.6–1 GPa) and temperatures (800– 1000 °C) corroborate these observations and also note depletion of Ba, Rb, Cs, and U in metasedimentary residues (Bea and Montero, 1999; Fornelli et al., 2002; Guernina and Sawyer, 2003; Harris and Inger, 1992; Reid et al., 1989; Schmid, 1979; Schnetger, 1994; Solar and Brown, 2001; Watt and Harley, 1993). While it is difficult to quantify these effects, the implication is that the refractory residues of partially melted metasedimentary rocks will have K$_2$O contents around 1 wt.%, and thus heat-production rates comparable to that shown in Fig. 3. Moreover, mixtures of residues produced by experimental melting have compositions similar to average post-Archean medium- to high-pressure granulites (Fig. 7).
4. Continental relamination

If the lower continental crust is more felsic than commonly believed, and if significant proportions of the crustal rocks that are subducted remain buoyant enough to resist being recycled back into the mantle, a large amount of subducted crust could be relaminated to the base of the crust in the upper plate. Perhaps some of this material undergoes sufficient melt loss that it remains in the lower crust as a dense, high-wave speed, and refractory—yet relatively silica rich—residue. Here we explore this possibility for four different tectonic settings.

4.1. Refining during sediment subduction

Trenches subduct significant volumes of sediment to depths greater than 50 km (Fig. 2) (Clift and Vannucchi, 2004; Reinecke, 1991; Scholl and von Huene, 2007). About 25% of this sediment is chert or carbonate (Plank and Langmuir, 1998) that will undergo minimal changes in mineralogy and volatile content during subduction (Connolly, 2005; Hacker, 2008; Kerrick and Connolly, 2001; Massonne et al., 2007). The rest, however, ranges from pelite to wacke to volcaniclastic sediment (Plank and Langmuir, 1998), and will undergo phase changes and physical property changes as described and illustrated above.

At subduction-zone conditions of 800 °C and 3 GPa, ~10% of subducting sediment is negatively buoyant with respect to the upper mantle (Behn et al., in review). The remaining 90% are positively buoyant with respect to the upper mantle and may detach from the downgoing plate and rise as diapirs through the mantle wedge to relaminate the upper plate (Behn et al., in review), either at the base of cold, high viscosity mantle “lithosphere” (Gerya and Meilick, 2011) or at the base of arc crust (Fig. 16 in 9, Behn et al., in review). We...
expect that the general case should be asent of buoyant material to the base of arc crust, since high upper mantle temperatures extend to the base of the crust in arcs (Kelemen et al., 2003b) rendering viscosities low enough to permit viscous flow due to lithologic buoyancy contrasts (Jull and Kelemen, 2001). UHP xenoliths in South African and Siberian kimberlites, containing coesite-kyanite-sandine-omphacite-garnet with metasedimentary d18O values, record ~1200 °C and 4 GPa (Sharp et al., 1992) consistent with conditions for diapirs passing through the mantle wedge, and with phase equilibrium experiments at these conditions (Spandler et al., 2010). Other numerical and analog models of subduction suggest that a significant fraction of subducted sediment is either (a) thrust directly into or beneath arc lower crust, or (b) underplated to the base of the arc crust following extrusion back up a “subduction channel” (Chenenda et al., 1995; Currie et al., 2007; Gerya et al., 2007; Gorczyk et al., 2006; Warren et al., 2008).

Sediments introduced into the mantle by subduction are likely to undergo divergent paths depending on whether they are felsic or mafic. Volumetrically minor, mafic sediments can become negatively buoyant with respect to upper mantle peridotite and continue to descend, whereas more-abundant, more-felsic and carbonate-rich sediments remain positively buoyant and may remain at the base of the plate crust (Fig. 2A). The Swakane gneiss (Matzel et al., 2004) and the Skagit gneiss (Gordon et al., 2010; Misch, 1968) in the Washington Cascades may represent such relaminated sediments. This may help to explain why these rocks, which record peak pressures ~1 GPa (Valley et al., 2003) and are exposed today, overlie 35–40 km thick continental crust (Das and Nolet, 1998). Either these rocks were in the mid-crust in an “Andean” margin with anomalous, 60–70 km thick crust during peak metamorphism, or the lower crustal material underlying these rocks at present was emplaced there via subduction after peak metamorphism of the exposed gneisses.

4.2. Refining during arc subduction

Trenches subduct seamounts, arcs, and igneous plateaus at significant rates (Yamamoto et al., 2009). Igneous rocks in intra-oceanic arcs are composed of mafic to felsic volcanic rocks, an intermediate-composition middle crust, mafic lower crust, and a thin pyroxenite layer (e.g., Dhuime et al., 2009; Greene et al., 2006; Jagoutz et al., 2009; Kelemen et al., 2003a; Rioux et al., 2010). At the pressures and temperatures typical of active arcs, the volcanic and plutonic rocks are positively buoyant with respect to the upper mantle (Behn and Kelemen, 2006). During subduction, however, the density increase in the mafic portions of the arc crust will be sufficient to cause it to become negatively buoyant with respect to the mantle, whereas the intermediate to felsic portions of an arc (e.g., the 'wacke' component, equivalent to andesitic igneous rocks) will remain positively buoyant (Fig. 2B). Behn et al. (Behn et al., in review) showed that typical subduction-zone conditions are sufficient to cause 102–103 m-scale layers that are 200 kg/m3 less dense than the mantle to undergo diapiric separation at temperatures <800 °C.

Thus, subducting volcanoplutonic arcs may undergo density-driven separation: the mafic igneous rocks become gravitationally unstable eclogite that is returned to the mantle, whereas the more-felsic igneous rocks remain buoyant with respect to the upper mantle and may be reycled to the base of the crust in the overlying plate (Fig. 2B). The felsic rocks may become hot enough to produce a melt that rises to even shallower crustal levels.

4.3. Refining during subduction erosion

In about 75% of the volcanoplutonic arcs on Earth, forearc crust is being ablated by the downwelling plate (Clift and Vannucchi, 2004; Scholl and Von Huene, 2007); this material must either be subducted into the deep mantle or thrust beneath the upper plate crust (Fig. 16 in 9) as is proposed for the Salinian block in central California (Barth et al., 2003). Scholl and Von Huene concluded that ~95% of this ablated rock is subducted deep into the mantle by assuming that the ablated lower crust is mafic and that global exposures of high-pressure crustal rocks are small. However, i) much of the arc crust is composed of metasediments and other rocks derived from the top of the subducting plate, and from intermediate to felsic arc volcanic, volcanoclastic and plutonic rock, rather than mafic lower arc crust, ii) large volumes of (ultra)high-pressure terrains are known (see below), iii) even larger volumes of granulite facies metamorphic rocks may have gone to eclogite-facies conditions and then re-equilibrated at the base of the crust, iv) thrust imbrication of fore-arc material into arc lower crust does not require eclogite-facies conditions, and v) the mass of radiogenic 40Ar in the atmosphere suggests that <30% of the continental crust has been recycled into the mantle (Coltice et al., 2000). Numerical models (Gerya and Melilick, 2011; Gerya and Stöckhert, 2006; Gerya et al., 2007; Keppie et al., 2009) also suggest that ablated crustal material may not be subducted into the asthenosphere, but may instead be reeled to the base of the crust in the upper plate either by extrusion up the subduction channel or via diapirs through the mantle wedge.

Insight into the physical and chemical processes during subduction erosion comes from an unusual suite of 11 Ma xenoliths from the Pamir. These xenoliths encompass a broad range of lithologies, dominated by metasedimentary rocks (see Supplementary Text in Behn et al., in review for a discussion of criteria for identifying metasediments, and the outcome of such methods) and felsic to mafic meta-igneous rocks. All have eclogite-facies mineralogies, such as garnet+clinopyroxene+kyanite+K-feldspar+quartz in metapelites (Hacker et al., 2005). Zircon and monazite ages show that these rocks were derived from the Asian upper plate (Ducea et al., 2003)—i.e., they are truly products of subduction erosion. Mineral compositions reveal that the xenoliths recrystallized at ~2.7 GPa (~90 km depth) and 1050 °C (Fig. 8A), within the mantle beneath the 75 km-thick Asian crust. As these rocks were typical upper crustal rocks at the time they were tectonically eroded from the upper plate, they must have undergone massive devolatilization and melting—and concomitant changes in physical properties—during subduction (Fig. 5). Indeed, the xenoliths have calculated densities and P-wave velocities as high as ~3500 kg/m3 and ~8.3 km/s (Fig. 8B), as expected for crustal residues of melting, and typical of the lower crust and upper mantle.

Thus, subduction erosion is capable of inducing profound changes in rock physical properties, such that mafic rocks become gravitationally unstable eclogite, and felsic rocks become positively to neutrally buoyant and rise into the lower crust or to the base of the crust in the overthrust plate (Fig. 2C). The felsic rocks are also likely to produce a melt that rises to higher crustal levels (e.g. producing the Cenozoic magmatism of the Pamir, Schwab et al., 2004).

4.4. Refining during subduction of continental crust

Metamorphic terrains containing coesite document the exhumation of continental rocks from depths of >100 km throughout the Phanerozoic, and have been interpreted to have formed during subduction of continental margins (Coleman and Wang, 1995). These so-called ultrahigh-pressure (UHP) terrains vary greatly in size, from the >30,000 km2 terrains in Norway and China, to small kilometer-scale bodies (Ernst et al., 2007; Kylander-Clark et al., in review). All are dominated by quartzofeldspathic gneiss with a few percent mafic rock (eclogite). Some include sedimentary or rift-volcanic sequences suggesting that they were sediment-covered passive margins prior to subduction (e.g., Oberhansli et al., 2002; Svenningsen, 2001). UHP terrains have now been discovered in most well-studied Phanerozoic continental orogenetic belts (Liou et al., 2004)—
Indeed, many continental orogens have undergone multiple UHP episodes (Brueckner and van Rooymund, 2004).

While some felsic gneisses do record eclogite facies conditions (e.g., Oberhaensli et al., 1985) most felsic UHP rocks, have undergone such extensive retrograde metamorphism during decompression and later cooling that they preserve little or no record of metamorphism at peak pressure. Commonly, only a few mafic eclogite enclaves within felsic gneisses, and high-pressure phases locally preserved in garnets in felsic gneisses, reveal that the entire terrain was subducted to mantle depths. It is not known how many granulite terrains and even batholithic rocks were subducted to these depths and subsequently were completely overprinted without a trace of their UHP history.

Most UHP rocks were metamorphosed at peak conditions of 800 °C and 3 GPa (Fig. 8A) (Hacker, 2006). Such conditions produce significant increases in density (Massonne et al., 2007) and velocity (Fig. 8B). However, because it is dominantly felsic material, large proportions of subducting continental crust will remain buoyant with respect to the upper mantle at UHP conditions and could rise as either coherent blocks (e.g., Hacker et al., 2010), subduction channel plumes (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007).

Indeed, all UHP terrains show a post-UHP granulite- to amphibolite-facies (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007). Most UHP rocks were metamorphosed at peak conditions of 800 °C and 3 GPa (Fig. 8A) (Hacker, 2006). Such conditions produce significant increases in density (Massonne et al., 2007) and velocity (Fig. 8B). However, because it is dominantly felsic material, large proportions of subducting continental crust will remain buoyant with respect to the upper mantle at UHP conditions and could rise as either coherent blocks (e.g., Hacker et al., 2010), subduction channel plumes (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007).

Indeed, all UHP terrains show a post-UHP granulite- to amphibolite-facies (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007). Most UHP rocks were metamorphosed at peak conditions of 800 °C and 3 GPa (Fig. 8A) (Hacker, 2006). Such conditions produce significant increases in density (Massonne et al., 2007) and velocity (Fig. 8B). However, because it is dominantly felsic material, large proportions of subducting continental crust will remain buoyant with respect to the upper mantle at UHP conditions and could rise as either coherent blocks (e.g., Hacker et al., 2010), subduction channel plumes (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007).

Indeed, all UHP terrains show a post-UHP granulite- to amphibolite-facies (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007). Most UHP rocks were metamorphosed at peak conditions of 800 °C and 3 GPa (Fig. 8A) (Hacker, 2006). Such conditions produce significant increases in density (Massonne et al., 2007) and velocity (Fig. 8B). However, because it is dominantly felsic material, large proportions of subducting continental crust will remain buoyant with respect to the upper mantle at UHP conditions and could rise as either coherent blocks (e.g., Hacker et al., 2010), subduction channel plumes (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007).

Indeed, all UHP terrains show a post-UHP granulite- to amphibolite-facies (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007). Most UHP rocks were metamorphosed at peak conditions of 800 °C and 3 GPa (Fig. 8A) (Hacker, 2006). Such conditions produce significant increases in density (Massonne et al., 2007) and velocity (Fig. 8B). However, because it is dominantly felsic material, large proportions of subducting continental crust will remain buoyant with respect to the upper mantle at UHP conditions and could rise as either coherent blocks (e.g., Hacker et al., 2010), subduction channel plumes (Li and Gerya, 2009) or diapirs (Little et al., in review; Yin et al., 2007).
plate, producing a possible sediment-relamination SiO$_2$ flux (SRSF) of 1.5–2.1 Tg/yr. About 10% of subducting sediments, with a SiO$_2$ content around 50 wt.%, may be returned to the mantle, resulting in a SiO$_2$ flux back into the mantle of 0.2–0.3 Tg/yr.

It is difficult to estimate the global average arc subduction rate (wherein the arc is part of the subducting plate, distinct from subduction erosion of the upper plate). The current length of intra-oceanic arcs is ~10,000 km. The mean intra-oceanic arc age (average age of arc initiation, weighted by arc length) is ~65 Myr and the weighted mean arc cross section is 2000 km$^2$ (data from Reymer and Schubert, 1984). If total arc length and arc subduction/accrretion rates have been constant during the past 65 Myr, intra-oceanic arcs have been created at a rate of 0.15 km$^3$/yr. This sets an upper limit to the arc subduction rate, as an unknown fraction of this material has been accreted to plate margins. About half of intra-oceanic arc crust is felsic, with an average SiO$_2$ content of 63–66 wt.% (calculated for the Talkeetna arc, Hacker et al., 2008). Assuming a rock density of 2800 kg/m$^3$ results in an upper bound on the SiO$_2$ flux of 0.14 Tg/yr for the felsic portions of subducted intra-oceanic arcs (arc-relamination SiO$_2$ flux, ARSF). All of this felsic material could be relaminated. The other, mafic half of intra-oceanic arcs, with ~45–55 wt.% SiO$_2$ and a density of ~3000 kg/m$^3$ may be returned to the mantle upon eclogitization, resulting in an upper bound on the SiO$_2$ flux back into the mantle of 0.11 Tg/yr.

The global average subduction erosion rate is ~1.4–2.0 km$^3$/yr (Clift and Vannucchi, 2004; Scholl and von Huene, 2007). About 25% of this occurs in intra-oceanic arcs and ~75% in continental arcs; above we assumed that intra-oceanic arcs are 50% mafic, here we assume that continental arcs are the same. Assuming that the felsic portions of arcs contain ~63–66 wt.% SiO$_2$, have a density of 2800 kg/m$^3$, and are all relaminated, results in a possible subduction-erosion relamination SiO$_2$ flux (ERSF) of ~1.3–1.8 Tg/yr for felsic rocks. The mafic portions of eroding arcs, with ~50 wt.% SiO$_2$ and a density of 3000 kg/m$^3$, may be returned to the mantle as eclogite, resulting in a SiO$_2$ flux back into the mantle of 1.1–1.5 Tg/yr.

To estimate the rate of continent-collision subduction, consider the modern Alpine–Himalayan orogen, which constitutes the major Cenozoic collisional zone. This orogen is ~10,000 km long. Tertiary shortening is ~500 km in the Alps (Schmid et al., 1996), and ~2750 km in the Himalaya (Dewey et al., 1989). If a 25-km thick crustal section was subducted a mere 100 km beyond Moho depth along the length of the Alpine–Himalayan chain over the last 50 Myr, this yields a volume of ~2.5 × 10$^7$ km$^3$ or an average rate of ~0.5 km$^3$/yr. Assuming that continental crust contains ~61 wt.% SiO$_2$ (Rudnick and Gao, 2003) or more (this paper) and a density of ~2800 kg/m$^3$, results in a possible continent-relamination SiO$_2$ flux (CRSF) of ~0.6 Tg/yr. Some unknown fraction of mafic material (shown as 25% in Fig. 9) is returned to the mantle.

The present volume of continental crust on Earth is ~6 × 10$^9$ km$^3$, corresponding to an SiO$_2$ mass of 1 × 10$^{10}$ Tg for a density of 2800 kg/m$^3$ and a SiO$_2$ concentration of 60–65 wt.%. The estimates from the previous four paragraphs imply that felsic crustal material—with sufficiently low density to remain buoyant with respect to the upper mantle—carries SiO$_2$ into subduction zones at a rate ~3.5 Tg/yr (~1.5 SRSF + ~0.1 ARSF + ~1.3 ERSF + ~0.6 CRSF). If all of this buoyant subducted material is relaminated to the underside of the continental crust, the entire crust could have been relaminated in ~2.7 Ga. During the same period, a SiO$_2$ flux of ~1.8 Tg/yr may have been returned to the mantle. This has negligible effect on the composition of the upper mantle, which has ~5 × 10$^{11}$ Tg SiO$_2$ (mantle densities and composition from Kennett et al., 1995; McDonough and Sun, 1995).

While our paper demonstrates that present-day subduction and recycling fluxes are more than sufficient to process the existing volume of continental crust, our analysis does not allow us to determine when relamination processes became important in continental evolution. Obviously, if subduction did not occur in the Hadean or Archean, the relamination processes we describe would not have been active. Also, it is evident that recycling of continental sediments could not have occurred before the initial generation of continental crust.

6. Limitations of the relamination model

There are several limitations to our relamination model for crustal differentiation in subduction zones. Here we list a few.

1. Fluid-fluxed melting is ignored. However, porosities are so low in metamorphic rocks and H$_2$O solubilities in silicate melts are so high that the amount of melt produced by fluid-fluxed melting may be minor.

2. Decompression melting is ignored. This will generate only small amounts of melt in rocks already depleted by high pressure melting at temperatures as high as 1100 °C, but will produce large amounts of melt in fertile lithologies, for example when cold, felsic diapirs heat and decompress as they ascend through the mantle wedge (Fig. 5).

3. Relatively few dehydration-melting experiments have been conducted and melt activity models are still insufficiently accurate.

4. The effects of secular variation in Earth tectonics are ignored. If, for example, continental subduction did not occur during the Precambrian, our rate calculations cannot be extended to Archean times.

5. The direct effects of weathering on crustal differentiation (Albarede and Michard, 1986; Lee et al., 2008; Taylor and McLennan, 1985)—have been ignored, although weathering is implicit in our model as it is the means by which sediment is produced, and the process that produces peraluminous pelitic sediments from metaluminous protoliths.

7. Tests of the relamination model

Potential tests of the relamination model could derive from secular variation in certain isotopic systems, such as Ph, or from field studies. For example, do large metasedimentary terrains or xenoliths suites show an inverse relationship between detrital zircon age and paleodepth? Locations in which to assess this include the Washington Cascades (as noted above), the Pelona–Orocopia–Rand-type schists of California and Arizona (e.g., Barth et al., 2003), or the Catalina Schist of southern California (Kimbrough and Grove, 2007). What fraction of Barrovian metamorphic sequences have an earlier UHP history, indicating relamination of subducted continental material? What fraction of UHP terranes were not subducted and exhumed as coherent sheets (Andersen et al., 1991), but instead rose as diapirs (Little et al., in press; Yin et al., 2007)?

8. Conclusions

The composition of the lower continental crust is incompletely constrained; it has been inferred—on the basis of heat flow and xenolith compositions—to be relatively mafic, but a review of the available constraints indicates that the middle and lower crust together could contain significant volumes of felsic rocks and have an average SiO$_2$ content as high as 64 wt.%. In subduction zones sensu lato, rocks undergo prograde metamorphism, partial melting, and melt extraction processes that lead to moderate increases in seismic velocity and density for most rocks, and to major increases in velocity and density for mafic rocks. The end result is that mafic rocks are dense enough to sink within the mantle, whereas felsic rocks are positively to neutrally buoyant and can relamate the base of the upper plate crust. This can take place during sediment subduction, subduction erosion, subduction of arc crust, and subduction of continental crust. Estimated mass fluxes for these processes are sufficiently large that they could have refined the composition of the entire continental crust over the lifetime of Earth, leading to the present composition of the crust.
Acknowledgments

Roberta Rudnick graciously provided an updated database of post-Archean granulate terrain compositions and lower-crustal xenolith compositions, supplementing the landmark study of Rudnick and Presko (1990). Mike Brown generously pointed us to the literature on melting of natural rocks. Reviews by Taras Gerya, Nina Simon, and anonymous reviewer were helpful in improving the presentation of the manuscript. This material is based upon work supported by National Science Foundation grant OCE-0646734.

References


